Critical Reviews in 5 Steps:

Curated by

Renate Kahlke, Mark Lee, & Kevin W. Eva

01. Focus

- Develop your question losing focus risks the review appearing like a random collection of thoughts
- Draw on diverse expertise by sharing your idea early and often; identify sources of evidence from diverse disciplines, theories, and methodologies
- Build your team. Engage those whose views and backgrounds are complementary



03. Appraise

- Appraise literature based on expertise and judgement, rather than a priori inclusion and exclusion criteria
- Only include articles that speak best to your research question
- Keep a record of the rationale for decisions while being reflexive and transparent when reporting methods



02. Generate Data

- The cyclic and iterative process of a critical review includes conversing with experts. testing various literatures, and honing the research question
- An academic librarian can help you develop a search strategy
- Hand-searching reference lists and using search engines to track citations are beneficial



04. Sample

- Limited to sharing a sample of the sources encountered
- · Prioritize works that offer the most influential evidence or argument, while carefully ensuring representation of broader literature and theory
- Sample sufficiency is achieved when your synthesis achieve the goal of a meaningful contribution



05. Analyze

- As a genre, there is no predetermined analytical protocol
- Draw on techniques from qualitative research methodologies or other review types to support your process
- Your approach may be inductive (generating new theoretical perspectives) or deductive (applying existing concepts or theories to interpret a topic differently)
- Consider the meaning behind your contribution; practice-relevant problem; proposing a new theoretical perspective; conceptual framework; or best practice to shift the way others in the field think
- Reflect on what methods will lead from exploration to creation of a cohesive, sensible, and compelling research output



